

A SURVEY AND QUESTIONNAIRE ON IMPLEMENTATION
OF RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING
PROOFREADING IN SPELLING

A Field Report
Presented to
The School of Graduate Studies
Drake University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science in Education

by
Kathryn E. Anstine
December 1970

1970
Am 85

A SURVEY AND QUESTIONNAIRE ON IMPLEMENTATION
OF RECOMMENDATIONS REGARDING
PROOFREADING IN SPELLING

by

Kathryn E. Anstine

Approved by Committee:

Kylnard Kiel

Frances Dyer

Edward Dyer
Associate Dean of the School of Graduate Studies

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	PAGE
I. INTRODUCTION	1
The Problem	1
Statement of the problem	1
Importance of the study	2
Purpose of the Study	3
Procedures of the Study	3
Limitations of the Study	4
II. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE	5
Proofreading in Spelling	5
Techniques for Teaching Proofreading in Spelling	10
Conclusions from the Review of the Literature	25
III. PROCEDURES AND RESULTS	28
A Review of Ten Spelling Series	28
Results of the Questionnaire	41
IV. SUMMARY, RESULTS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDA- TIONS	47
Summary	47
Results	47
Conclusions	49
Recommendations	50
BIBLIOGRAPHY	53
APPENDICES	58

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	PAGE
I. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Basic Goals in Spelling</u> by McGraw-Hill Inc., 1968	31
II. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Harper / Row Basic Speller</u> by Harper & Row, Publishers, 1965	32
III. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>My Word Book</u> 1-6 and <u>Spelling</u> 7-8 by Lyons and Carnahan, 1966 . .	33
IV. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Power to Spell</u> by Houghton Mifflin Company, 1967	34
V. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Sound and Sense in Spelling</u> by Harcourt Brace & World, 1967	35
VI. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Spell Correctly</u> by Silver Burdett Company, 1968	36
VII. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Spelling</u> by Ginn and Company, 1967	37
VIII. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Spelling and Writing Patterns</u> by Aileen Brothers, 1969	38
IX. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>The Reading Road to Spelling</u> by Harper & Row, Publishers, 1965 . . .	39
X. The Dictionary and Proofreading Skills that are Presented in <u>Words and Patterns</u> by Science Research Associates, Inc., 1970 . .	40

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

A number of recommendations regarding proofreading have been made and are still being made by spelling authorities. Evidence is available, however, to indicate that many of these recommendations have not been widely incorporated into the texts and school curriculums. In many instances the primary problem with spelling instruction appears to be a need for more application of proofreading procedures which are based upon the best thinking in this area. It is the writer's belief that this is especially true in the area of teaching students a systematic approach to proofreading their spelling.

I. THE PROBLEM

Statement of the problem. It has been claimed that spelling is not being effectively taught in the public schools. Leading authorities have not agreed if competency in spelling can be attained better through a general use of spelling rules or through a limited use of rules. Also, those involved in the spelling controversy have not agreed whether spelling should be taught from one of the many spelling books that make use of word lists, by using a context approach, through linguistic methodology or one of

the many other approaches. All of these methods have had one basic weakness: the problem of transferring what is taught during the spelling lesson to daily written work. Since research indicates that most spelling errors are highly individual, solutions to the problem of transfer have generally involved some aspect of proofreading written work. Some teachers and textbooks suggested that a student proofread his work for spelling errors; however, they provided very little in the way of actual techniques for teaching children to proofread. Based on the assumption that there would be fewer spelling mistakes if students were taught definite techniques in how to proofread their work, the purpose of this study was to review the literature and ten spelling series to see what definite techniques for teaching proofreading can be found. It was also the purpose of this study to investigate whether or not forty-two second and fifth grade teachers in the Marshalltown, Iowa Public School System emphasized proofreading in their spelling program and what, if any, techniques in proofreading they taught their students.

Importance of the study. Spelling ability is important even though spelling is considered to be one of the minor subjects in school. Spelling errors detract from the effectiveness of any written work; therefore, pupils must develop the ability to spell as well as possible if they

are to take pride in their own work and be judged worthy of employment by others.

It is hoped that the findings of some of the reviewed literature and some of the answers to the following questionnaires will be an aid in strengthening the spelling programs in our schools.

II. PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this field report was to review the literature and ten spelling series to see what definite techniques for teaching proofreading could be found. It was also the purpose of this study to investigate whether or not forty-two second and fifth grade teachers in the Marshalltown, Iowa Public School System emphasized proofreading in their spelling programs and what, if any, techniques in proofreading they taught their students.

III. PROCEDURES OF THE STUDY

The data for this field report were secured through research into books, professional publications, and spelling series available concerning proofreading in spelling. Data were also collected by use of a questionnaire that was given to forty-two second and fifth grade teachers in the public school system in Marshalltown, Iowa.

IV. LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

This study was limited to beliefs regarding proof-reading of thirty-five spelling authorities. The review of spelling texts was limited to ten spelling series published in the last five years. Another limitation is that the questionnaire was given to a small sample population of only second and fifth grade teachers in the Marshalltown, Iowa Public School System.

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

To improve one's teaching it is necessary to become familiar with ideas that have been used successfully and to try some of them if they seem to have some merit.

It is the purpose of this chapter to review the literature that pertains to proofreading in spelling and to pay particular attention to the suggested techniques for the teaching of proofreading in spelling.

I. PROOFREADING IN SPELLING

From 1919 up to the present time spelling authorities such as Tidyman,¹ Pryor and Pittman,² Fitzgerald,³ Spache,⁴ and Dawson and Dingee⁵ have been stating that it is the

¹W. F. Tidyman, The Teaching of Spelling (Younkers, New York: World Book Company, 1919), p. 20.

²H. C. Pryor and M. S. Pittman, Guide to Teaching Spelling (New York: Macmillan Company, 1921), p. 131.

³Virgil E. Herrick and Leland B. Jacobs (eds.), Children and the Language Arts (Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1955), p. 245.

⁴George Spache, "What's Wrong with our Teaching of Spelling?" Education, LXXVI (January, 1956), 298.

⁵Mildred A. Dawson and Frieda Hayes Dingee, Children Learn the Language Arts (Minneapolis: Burgess Publishing Company, 1966), p. 60.

teacher's duty to develop in the students a spelling consciousness, which is the ability to determine whether a word is spelled correctly or not, and a spelling conscience, which is the genuine desire to spell correctly. In editing, these are two of the skills involved in proofreading.

Although Tireman¹ as far back as 1924 concluded in a study that pupils do not possess the ability to proofread their own written material for spelling errors, spelling authorities have continued to support the theory that proofreading for spelling errors is a skill that every pupil should master. Hildreth believed that the habit of proofreading is a characteristic of all good spellers and listed it as a requirement in any spelling program.² Horn and Otto said that proofreading is a habit which children must develop in order to acquire proficiency in spelling.³ McKee stated that pupils are ordinarily not very good at proofreading but he believed that the habit can be established

¹Lloyd Spencer Tireman, "Ability of Grade Pupils to Proof-read their Written Work" (unpublished Master's thesis, University of Iowa, 1924), 36.

²Gertrude Hildreth, Teaching Spelling--A Guide to Basic Principles and Practices (New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1955), p. 215.

³Thomas D. Horn and Henry J. Otto (eds.), Spelling Instruction: A Curriculum Wide Approach (Austin, Texas: University of Texas, 1954), p. 6.

and the skill improved through practice.¹

Mary Montebello felt that specific spelling objectives should be set up at each grade level. Among other things she believed these objectives should include such things as having a child able to copy accurately the words he needs in writing by the end of the first grade; having a child take pride in his spelling by the end of the second grade; and having him feel responsible for the correct spelling and pronunciation of all the words he has learned, refer to sources when in need of help in spelling, and being able to proofread his written work for errors in spelling by the end of the third grade.²

Hanna and Hanna have written that not until a student can regularly proofread his written work as a matter of course will he make sure of eliminating the careless errors that may plague him for his entire life.³ Frasch⁴ and DeBoer⁵ state that most children who are taught to proofread

¹Paul McKee, Language in the Elementary School (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1939), p. 369.

²Lowry W. Harding (ed.), Guiding Children's Language Learning (Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown Company Publishers, 1967), pp. 321-322.

³Paul R. Hanna and Jean S. Hanna, Focus of Power (New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1959), p. 20.

⁴Dorothy K. Frasch, "How Well Do Sixth-graders Proofread for Spelling Errors?" Elementary School Journal, LXV (April, 1965), 381.

⁵John J. DeBoer, "Composition, Handwriting and Spelling," Review of Educational Research, XXXI (April, 1961), 168.

systematically develop the ability to detect errors in their own writing.

Gillespie said that teachers need to help the students progress through the five following basic steps, starting in the first grade, to start them off on the road to spelling correctly. These steps are to: see the word, say it, think it, write it and most of all, check it.¹

Personke and Yee felt that spelling instruction should be determined by the totality of spelling behavior rather than the "either - or" approaches. They felt there are three channels for processing spelling behavior with one bypass and one detour route. Descriptions of them are as follows:

The memory channel (M) has been so designated because it operates with reference only to the memory drum of the speller. The kinesthetic detour (Mk) maintains a similar position and is simply a more efficient variation of the (M) channel. The checking channel (C) represents spelling behavior which refers to external inputs immediately upon making an initial response and before writing the word. The proofread channel (P) represents the behavior of a speller who first writes the word, with or without the intent that what he writes is a correct response, and then refers to external inputs for confirmation of the correctness of the written response. The detour (Pr) is used when the speller receives information from the external inputs that his response was not correct.²

¹Harold G. Shane, Mary E. Redding, and Margaret C. Gillespie, Beginning Language Arts Instruction With Children (Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill, 1961), p. 239.

²Carl Personke and Albert H. Yee, "A Model for the Analysis of Spelling Behavior," Elementary English, XLIII (March, 1966), 281.

Personke and Yee then went on to say that the checking, proofreading and detour channels are the learning channels. They also stated that no one channel should be considered the "correct" channel. The speller must choose how to spell a word according to the situational conditions and resources available to him and that channel most suitable to his requirements at the moment. To be able to do this, the speller must master all the channels of the total spelling behavior which includes proofreading.¹

Bennett said in 1967 that the increasing emphasis on the importance of proofreading in spelling made it one of the three significant developments in spelling at the present time.² He felt training in proofreading will make the most important contribution when a person is engaged in an ordinary writing task. It is then, Bennett felt, that an individual most often misspells words which he knows how to spell because he is not concentrating on spelling. These errors are merely due to carelessness and should be easily found if an individual knows how to proofread.³

Another reason that is so necessary to have an increase in the systematic training of proofreading is

¹Ibid., pp. 281-284.

²D. M. Bennett, New Methods and Material in Spelling (Blackburn: The Dominion Press, 1967), p. 121.

³Ibid., p. 14.

because of the increased use of spelling materials which employ self-corrected tests. Several users of the SRA Spelling Laboratories have emphasized the need for close supervision by the teacher, and especially checks on pupils' corrections of their own work. This will come as no surprise when one considers the difficulty pupils find in detecting their own errors in daily work.¹

II. TECHNIQUES FOR TEACHING PROOFREADING IN SPELLING

Most teachers have little difficulty achieving good results with students insofar as the spelling on word tests. It is not unusual, however, to hear a teacher complain that while the children can spell the words on Friday, they may misspell the same words on Monday in their written work. This problem, according to Thomas Horn, is generally a sign of poorly developed spelling consciousness. The student must be shown that spelling is personally important and that good spelling is essential to practically all writing situations.²

Greene and Petty state that a good attitude toward

¹Ibid., p. 104.

²Thomas D. Horn, "Research in Spelling," Elementary English, XXXVII (March, 1960), 175-176.

spelling is basic to a successful program but merely desiring to spell correctly will accomplish little unless certain habits such as the following have been established:

1. Being concerned about the spelling of words used in written expression. For the child, this means teaching him to think "Is this word spelled correctly?" and "Am I sure?" This habit is established by the development and maintenance of standards in written work and by repeatedly calling attention to the standards by the teacher.
2. Carefully proofreading all written work. This means examining each word carefully to see if it is spelled correctly. The teacher must insist that a misspelled word is a mistake in spelling whether the child knows better or not, and that the only way to avoid the making of such mistakes is to proofread for spelling errors.
3. Checking the spelling of all words about which the child is in doubt. The pupil should ask the teacher, or when skill of the dictionary¹ is developed, he should consult that authority.¹

Sharpe declared that a teacher must utilize pupil interest and provide students with a challenge to express ideas which in turn lead to a need for correct spelling and a desire to proofread the composition.² Dolch stated that the composition must be for an audience and the teacher should remind the student of the critical attitude of his audience toward spelling. When confronted with the fact

¹Harry A. Greene and Walter T. Petty, Developing Language Skills in the Elementary School (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1959), p. 260.

²Maida Wood Sharpe, "A Composition of Three Approaches to Teaching Spelling," English Review, XXXVII (May, 1960), 320.

that he is being judged by his spelling, the student should be motivated to check his guesses and proofread for mistakes.¹

Motivation to proofread is not sufficient. One writer was reminded of a twelfth grade boy who was an excellent student in everything but spelling. Although he carried and referred to a dictionary constantly, the boy misspelled half the words in any composition. It was apparent that desire and the use of the dictionary were not enough. Inability to use the dictionary for proofreading in spelling kept him from succeeding in spite of high motivation. Numerous teachers have had a student ask how he was to look up a word when he did not know how to spell it.²

Evidence suggests that techniques of proofreading for spelling are not being offered to children in their regular spelling programs. In part this is due to the fact that although spelling authorities recommend that students be encouraged to proofread their work for spelling errors, they do not give many suggestions on how to improve one's ability to proofread.

Mildred Wittick emphasized that proofreading should be taught systematically and sequentially. Texts in language

¹Edward W. Dolch, Better Spelling (Champaign, Illinois: Garrard Press, 1942), p. 100.

²Carl Personke and Lester Knight, "Proofreading and Spelling: A Report and a Program," Elementary English, XLIV (November, 1967), 768-769.

arts give lip service to the idea but very few give concrete steps to accomplish real proofreading. A plan should be worked out as to what is to be done to build concrete proofreading steps at each grade level.¹

In an effort to discover some facts regarding the spelling judgment of school children, McFarland in 1916 advocated dictating a list of words to grade pupils with the instructions that if they were positive of the spelling, they were to mark a "(P)" after it; if they were fairly positive, they were to mark it "(F)"; if they were doubtful, they were to mark it "(D)"; or if they were sure they could not spell the word, they were to mark it "(X)."²

In 1942, Dolch proposed a check-guess technique. Occasionally in written work, students realize that they are unsure of the spelling of a word. This uncertainty may lead to a quick guess as to the correct spelling. When such a guess is made, it is according to what is thought to be correct. When such guessing is done, Dolch insisted that the guess should be checked at once. In this way the correct spelling is learned. Dolch suggested further that to motivate children to check guesses, the teacher should

¹Mildred L. Wittick, "Correctness and Freshness-- Can Children's Writing Have Both?" Elementary School Journal, LX (March, 1960), 295.

²W. H. McFarland, "Relation Between Spelling Judgment and Spelling Vocabulary," Midland Schools (September, 1916), 19.

emphasize:

1. That a guess may put down before them the wrong word picture which will cause him to learn the word wrong leading to difficult unlearning.
2. That writing turns up these unknowns. If the guess is not checked then, it will have to be guessed again and again until it is finally checked. If the check is made then, the word is learned and spelling knowledge will grow.
3. That check-guessing will increase one's sensitivity to error.¹

The habit of checking guesses is harder to secure in the upper grades since the student is more sure of himself and is willing to take chances. One plan to be used in these grades is the use of the dictionary for checking guesses. The dictionary must be available to all without constantly getting up to get one.² Intelligent use of the dictionary is essential to spelling, but is not easy to learn. It can be used in connection with initial syllables and furnishes a means for a systematic search for the correct spelling of words needed in writing.³

In 1948 Gertrude Hildreth wrote:

Spelling instruction should teach pupils how to locate doubtful spellings, and should give them real incentive for looking up doubtful spellings. Reference sources should be made available so that pupils can more easily look up words for themselves. Children should be taught to use the dictionary from the early grades; until they learn to use the dictionary, they should keep their own alphabetized word lists.⁴

¹Dolch, op. cit., pp. 63-66. ²Ibid., pp. 100-104.

³Thomas D. Horn, "How Syllables Can Help in Spelling," Education, LXXVI (January, 1965), 294.

⁴Gertrude Hildreth, "Word Frequency as a Factor in Learning to Read and Spell," Journal of Educational Research, XLI (February, 1948), 471.

Seven years later Hildreth wrote a book about the teaching of spelling in which she mentioned proofreading several times. She first suggested that children can get good practice in proofreading by reading other children's spelling test papers. She goes on to say that children may become discouraged if they have to recopy papers containing misspellings, so instead, they should write another composition using the same words, but trying to avoid the same errors.¹ Hildreth later suggested that the responsibility for correcting the pupil's written work has shifted from the teacher to the pupil. Although teachers may still need to do much of the correcting, they need not point out every misspelling and write the correct forms for the pupil. Instead, the teacher should indicate errors with check marks in the margin. Two checks indicate two words misspelled in the line. The pupil is then required to try to discover the misspelled words, and then to write the words correctly or list them in a notebook for future study. The teacher, said Hildreth, should make a rule never to accept a paper without requiring the pupil to check it over before handing it in even though the careless student finds it irksome. Proofreading should be begun as a skill in the primary grades. Children should be encouraged to spell as well as they can, then proofread and correct; or in other words,

¹Hildreth, op. cit., p. 94.

they should be given credit for erasing and correcting. The teacher should provide time in the day for direct training in proofreading, give demonstrations of what proofreading involves using paragraphs on the blackboard, give practice both in natural writing experiences as well as practice exercises, draw the children's attention to the difference between reading and proofreading, help the pupils become constantly more efficient in using the dictionary to verify written work and show that employers value correct spelling.

In proofreading material written by others, the pupil should read it first for meaning, then for spelling errors so his mind will be centered on the thought rather than the technical accuracy. Proofreading should be done when the material is cold. Proofreading editorials for a class or school newspaper gives purposeful practice. Pupils should proofread their own copy before handing it to a partner for checking. The proofreading partner should initial the material. When the material is corrected, a spelling ratio should be computed. Typing encourages proofreading because it is so legible. The use of word reference sources, including the dictionary, are very important in the area of proofreading.¹

In 1959 Goss investigated the effect of proofreading upon accuracy in spelling using five hundred and forty-three

¹Ibid., pp. 214-221.

fifth grade pupils in Tulsa, Oklahoma in his study. Goss distributed the students into eight experimental classes and eight control classes. The experimental group was given special instruction and experience in proofreading for a twelve week period which included proofreading exercises prepared in cursive writing by the investigator and proofreading compositions written by the pupils themselves. During this same period the control group received no instruction in proofreading. After the twelve week period, the experimental group showed significant improvement in ability to locate spelling errors in cursive writing exercises prepared by the investigator. By contrast Goss found that the control group showed no significant improvement in proofreading prepared exercises.

In addition the experiment showed that both groups improved significantly in discovering errors in their own compositions with the experimental group showing a greater change.¹

In the early 1960's Clark McKowen and his students worked out a technique for improving the students' proofreading with seemingly mutual satisfaction. McKowen would read the compositions and if he found even one spelling

¹James E. Goss, "Analysis of Accuracy of Spelling in Written Compositions of Elementary School Children and the Effects of Proofreading Emphasis Upon Accuracy," Dissertation Abstracts, XX (1959), 967.

error, the paper was returned ungraded. The student would then check for spelling errors without knowing how many there were. If any spelling errors remained when McKowen reread the paper, the whole job received a failing mark. The students lost no credit if the paper was clear the second time through and they were allowed to use any source to help them find the error. McKowen did not want to have to reread and proofread twice so he placed tiny unnoticeable dots on the lines where errors occurred, varying the location to avoid detection. He also used a code to indicate the grade the paper would receive when or if it was properly proofread. Thus, he could check the spelling and assign the grade in a matter of seconds. McKowen didn't feel overburdened and his students were strongly encouraged to develop a valuable habit. He estimated that in a matter of a few weeks sloppy spelling on first papers was reduced about seventy-five per cent.¹

In 1962 Oswalt made a study to determine the effects of proofreading for spelling errors on pupil achievement in spelling, recognizing words which needed correction, and correcting words recognized as misspelled. The study was done using three hundred and thirty-four fifth grade children in ten classrooms from five school districts in

¹Clark McKowen, "Proofreading for Spelling Errors," English Journal, LII (October, 1963), 530.

Pennsylvania. Oswalt designed thirty twenty-minute proofreading exercises that included such things as word study, dictionary study, word lists with errors, and paragraphs to proofread. The lessons were completed during thirty consecutive teaching days. The post testing showed among other things that:

1. Males of the fifth grade with intelligence quotients of one hundred and ten or below improved their achievement in spelling through systematic instruction in proofreading for spelling errors when their achievement was measured in terms of recognizing misspelled words on the spelling subtests of The Iowa Tests of Basic Skills.
2. Systematic instruction in proofreading for spelling errors positively improved the achievement of the fifth graders in spelling correctly those words recognized as misspelled.
3. Although the females derived benefits from the proofreading lessons, males derived more benefits from the instruction.

Ten weeks after the post testing, subjective evaluations from the five teachers of the experimental group were tabulated and reported as follows:

1. The pupils made more frequent and independent use of the dictionary for spelling help than they did before the experiment.
2. There seemed to be a carry-over of the proofreading habit to other written work.
3. The proofreading exercises helped stimulate interest in correct spelling; hence, they seemed to be partly responsible for building a "spelling conscience."¹

In 1965 Knight did a study in Austin, Texas to

¹William W. Oswalt, "The Effects of Proofreading for Spelling Achievement of Fifth Grade Pupils" (unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Temple University, 1962), pp. 23-67.

determine whether a program of teaching definite techniques of check-guessing and proofreading would improve the quality of spelling in written composition. Knight used four self-contained sixth grade classrooms which included forty-five boys and thirty-six girls. There were two control groups and two experimental groups. The program covered a three week period. During this period the experimental group received special instruction in techniques for check-guessing and proofreading for spelling accuracy, especially as related to written composition.

Knight defined his use of check-guessing and proofreading as follows:

Check-guessing:

1. The best possible guess is made for any questionable spelling at the time the word is written, using individual knowledge about spelling.
2. A check is placed over the spelling when guessed.
3. The guess is checked against the correct spelling in the dictionary and any necessary corrections are made.

Proofreading:

1. The written material is gone over to make certain that all guesses have been checked.
2. The material is gone over and each word is studied individually and carefully with correct spelling in mind in precedence over just rereading the composition content.
3. Corrections of any spelling error found are made in the composition using the dictionary as the spelling authority.¹

¹Lester B. Knight, "The Effectiveness of a Program of Proofreading Instruction on Spelling In Written Composition" (unpublished Master's thesis, The University of Texas, 1965), p. 19.

Knight stated that an attempt was made to involve the control group as much as possible in identical language instruction except for the variable under investigation. Both groups wrote compositions, using the same themes, on the same days; both groups spent the same amount of time each day in language instruction; and in some instances both groups used identical lessons except for the emphasis on proofreading skills. Lesson one introduced the ideas of check-guessing and proofreading, and the technique of drawing one line through the questioned spelling and writing its corrected form above the word was also introduced. The techniques of proofreading every word in the composition and writing "Proofread for Spelling" at the end were also initiated. A film, a discussion of its content, and a writing experience summarizing the film helped in this introduction. The next four lessons were on the use of the dictionary. Each group spent approximately twenty minutes on each lesson. The experimental group was told that the dictionary was a most important tool in proofreading and the control group was told that a more efficient use of the dictionary would help them in finding word meaning or in pronunciation. These lessons included the alphabetizing of words, the use of guide words and drill in finding synonyms for certain words in the dictionary. On the sixth day the students spent thirty-five minutes in oral and written

practice in finding words in the dictionary, and making use of the Thorndike-Barnhart High School Dictionary's Common Spellings of English Chart. This emphasized to the students that they cannot always depend on "ear spelling" since there may be more than one spelling for a sound.

The next two lessons included the proofreading of previously written stories that contained spelling errors. These errors were taken from a list of commonly misspelled words in intermediate grades. The experimental group was reminded of the technique of drawing one line through any misspelled word and of correcting the word above the misspelling. The group was also told to look over every word for "spelling's sake," to use their spelling charts and their dictionaries in the process of proofreading. "Proof-read for Spelling" was written on their papers when the process was completed.

In lesson eight the students began to culminate the previous activities while writing dictated paragraphs. After the paragraph had been proofread, the class summarized the techniques for proofreading and check-guessing that had been covered. These were placed on a permanent chart as follows:

1. Place a check mark over any guess when written.
2. After work has been completed, go back over the work and check-guesses and correct any spelling errors.
3. Draw one line through misspelled words and correct them above the misspelled words.

4. In correcting words:
 - a. Use spelling rules.
 - b. Use common spellings of English chart.
 - c. Use the dictionary as the authority making use of guide words.
5. Write "Proofread for Spelling" at the end.

The chart was displayed so the experimental group would be constantly reminded to check-guess and proofread for spelling accuracy.

At this point in the program, the children were given an opportunity to write a utilitarian type of composition in the form of a book report. All the techniques involved in check-guessing and proofreading were reviewed by the experimental groups and the children were told that the best papers would be displayed.

On the tenth day the experimental group had a second lesson on writing a dictated paragraph. All the procedures previously stressed were repeated in this lesson. The practice of returning compositions the following day and discussing proofreading progress was a routine matter in all the written lessons.

The eleventh lesson was the proofreading of a spelling list taken from the group's basic speller. The students were told to listen carefully to the sounds of the twenty words as they were given by the teacher. The techniques for check-guessing and proofreading were repeated and the children checked their own work in class.

The twelfth lesson involved the writing of a

summary of a story that had been read from the basal reader during the week. Again check-guessing and proofreading techniques were emphasized to the experimental group while neatness, good sentences and diction were stressed to the control group.

Proofreading spelling lists was again the topic of instruction for the thirteenth lesson. The teachers pronounced the words without stressing individual sounds as before and the work was checked together in class.

The children wrote a friendly letter to a friend or relative in the next lesson. Having no spelling errors was stressed and the papers were checked and returned by the teachers. However, on lesson fifteen all papers were handed to the investigator who used the papers to interpret the results of teaching techniques for check-guessing and proofreading. This lesson was the writing of the children's own personal experiences, at the beginning of which several questions designed to stimulate thinking on past personal experiences were asked. Emphasis was placed on capitalization, punctuation, and good sentence structure to both groups. In addition, the experimental group was reminded of the check-guessing and proofreading techniques.¹

Knight's investigation yielded several definite

¹Ibid., pp. 30-40.

conclusions:

1. Boys receiving the instruction made fewer errors than those who did not.
2. Girls receiving the instruction made fewer errors than those who did not.
3. The total experimental group made fewer errors than the control group. All differences except the girls were significant at the .01 level of confidence.¹

III. CONCLUSIONS FROM THE REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Chapter II was devoted to a review of the literature that pertained to proofreading in spelling with a particular emphasis on the techniques for teaching students how to proofread their spelling. As a result of reviewing the literature, the following observations were made:

1. Though language authorities have for more than fifty years recommended the teaching of proofreading as a means of improving a student's ability to spell, there was a surprising lack of research to substantiate their recommendations.
2. It is also surprising that these same spelling authorities fail, on the most part, to include programs for the systematic instruction of proofreading.
3. It is even more surprising that these same spelling authorities used as motivators to encourage

¹Ibid., p. iii.

proofreading mostly high school and adult values such as the approval of friends and employers. The April, 1970 Elementary School Journal reports about a spelling experiment done with ninety-one children from the ages of eight to fourteen in British Columbia. Data presented in this study support the hypothesis that for elementary school pupils in regular classroom situations spelling proficiency can be increased through the use of material reinforcement (candy, pencils, erasers), paired with social reinforcement (words of praise, verbal or written).¹ It is also reasonable to assume that these kinds of motivations could be used when teaching the proofreading of spelling to the elementary school child; and, it is at the elementary level that the authorities seem to feel the teaching of proofreading should begin.

4. Finally, and most surprising to the writer was that almost no material pertaining to the teaching of proofreading in spelling could be found in periodicals, government publications or unpublished materials that have been written in the last

¹Eric W. Thomson and Charles G. Galloway, "Material Reinforcement and Success in Spelling," The Elementary School Journal, LXX (April, 1970), 398.

three years. With the positive results of the small-scale research done in the early sixties, it would have seemed reasonable that research on a larger scale would have followed within the next few years.

CHAPTER III

PROCEDURES AND RESULTS

The data presented in this chapter were gathered to see to what extent the proofreading of spelling was recommended by spelling series and used by forty-two second and fifth grade teachers in the Marshalltown, Iowa Public School System as a means of making students better spellers. These data will be presented in the following order: (1) a review of ten spelling series published in the last five years, and (2) a culmination of the remarks made by the second and fifth grade Marshalltown teachers on their questionnaires.

I. A REVIEW OF TEN SPELLING SERIES

Ten spelling series, published between 1965 and 1970 were reviewed to determine to what extent specific techniques for teaching proofreading were discussed. Five of the series were linguistic in nature. A list of the spelling series that were reviewed is presented in Bibliography C. Appendix B shows the questionnaire that was used to review the texts.

It was found that three of the series did not mention proofreading. One series included a proofreading lesson each week in the middle and upper grades while the

others mentioned proofreading in varying degrees. Where proofreading lessons were included, they were without exception the correcting of mistakes found in lists, sentences or paragraphs. Not one text gave suggestions to the teacher or pupils on methods of proofreading, none suggested teaching to proofread in sequential steps, and not one suggested that the teacher reward the students for proofreading.

All of the series taught dictionary skills that would help students look up words they do not know how to spell. These skills included the teaching of beginning sounds and alphabetizing in the lower grades and progressed to guide words, entry words, and pronunciation keys in the middle and upper grades.

Scott, Foresman's Listen, Speak and Write was used in most of the primary classrooms in Marshalltown as a guide in teaching spelling. In reviewing the first, second and third grade Listen, Speak and Write it was found that there was no mention of proofreading. Dictionary skills included beginning sounds, alphabetization, and the introduction of Pictionaries that had entry words classified as to meaning and function.¹

¹Marion Monroe, Ralph G. Nichols, W. Cabell Greet and William S. Gray, Learn to Listen, Speak and Write (Scott, Foresman and Company, 1960, 1961 and 1964).

Most of the upper grades in this school system used Follett's Spelling and Writing Patterns as a guide in teaching spelling. This was one of the ten series reviewed. Spelling and Writing Patterns considered an elementary dictionary as one of the prime learning tools in spelling and, therefore, suggested a great deal of time be spent teaching the spellings of various sounds. The series also suggested much time be used familiarizing pupils with the dictionary symbols. In their last two levels, Spelling and Writing Patterns emphasized proofreading as being very important in spelling.¹ Nine times during each year a game was used of finding mistakes in a paragraph. Even with all this emphasis, the guide does not suggest any methods or techniques for teaching proofreading in sequential steps.

Following are Tables I through X showing the dictionary and proofreading materials contained in the reviewed spelling series.

¹Morton Botel, Cora Holsclaw, Gloria Cammarota, and Aileen Brothers, Spelling and Writing Patterns (Follett Educational Corporation, 1968).

TABLE I

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED
IN BASIC GOALS IN SPELLING by McGRAW-HILL INC., 1968

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grades 4, 5,6,7,& 8
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	Yes, sentences to be corrected.	Yes, letters, etc. to be corrected.	Yes, something each week to be corrected.
Suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Teaches ABC order, but not as a dictionary skill.	Yes, teaches alphabetizing activities requiring the use of 1, 2, 3, 4, and 5 letters as a preparation for dictionary activities.		
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	No	No	No	No, but includes one in each book.
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	Helps in chart form in most units.
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	Yes
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	No	No	No	Yes

TABLE II

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
HARPER / ROW BASIC SPELLER by HARPER & ROW, PUBLISHERS, 1965

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grade 4	Grades 5 & 6
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	Yes, the texts all suggest that the pupils proofread their work at the close of each spelling lesson and make any necessary corrections.			
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	No	Teaches ABC order, but not as a dictionary skill.	Gives opportunity to alphabetize.	Teaches the use of guide words in the dictionary.
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	Yes
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	No	No	No	No

TABLE III

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
MY WORD BOOK 1-6 AND SPELLING 7-8 BY LYONS AND CARNAHAN, 1966

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grades 4, 5, 6, 7, & 8
emphasize that proof-reading is an impor- tant part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher should empha- size that the student should proofread?	Yes	Yes, and suggests that the teacher give the students time to proofread.		
suggest a teacher tell students that proof- reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that a series of lessons on proof- reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching stu- dents to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what meth- ods of helping stu- dents find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, begin- ning sounds.	Beginning sounds and ABC order.	ABC order, use of entry words, pro- nunciation keys, and the different spelling of con- sonant sounds.	
suggest that each student have a per- sonal desk copy of a dictionary?	Yes, in- cludes two kinds.	Yes, a dictionary is included at each grade level.		
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof- reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on diction- ary skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dic- tionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes	Yes, and tells the student he should have one constantly near for this spelling program.		

TABLE IV

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
POWER TO SPELL BY HOUGHTON MIFFLIN COMPANY, 1967

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grade 4	Grades 5 & 6
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, ABC order.	Yes, ABC order.	Yes, ABC order.	Yes, ABC order.
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	Yes, and one is included.	Yes, a dictionary is included in each speller and it is suggested that other dictionaries should be in the room.		
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	Yes, there is a chart on "How to Proofread" included in each speller.		
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

TABLE V

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
SOUND AND SENSE IN SPELLING BY HARCOURT BRACE & WORLD, 1967

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grades 4, 5,6,7,& 8
emphasize that proofreading is an important part of spelling?	No	Although "proofreading" was never mentioned, the general directions to the teachers told them to emphasize the importance of correct spelling in all written communications and that during the spelling period the students should be encouraged to check and correct written work from other curriculum areas.		
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	No			
suggest a teacher tell students that proofreading is an important part of spelling?	No			
suggest that a series of lessons on proofreading be used and if so, what are they?	No			
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, beginning sounds.	Beginning sounds and alphabetization.	Review of Grades 1 & 2 and the use of guide and entry words.	Review of Grades 1, 2, and 3 and the use of pronunciation keys.
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	Yes, includes a picture dictionary.	Yes, includes a dictionary at each level. Practice in using the dictionary is concentrated from grades 4 to 8.		
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proofreading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	Yes	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

TABLE VI

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
SPELL CORRECTLY BY SILVER BURDETT COMPANY, 1968

DOES THE TEXT	Grades2&3	Grades4&5	Grade 6	Grades 7&8
emphasize that proofreading is an important part of spelling?	No, although "proofreading" is not mentioned, the third day of each lesson there is a check point where teacher dictates words and the pupils are to write, check and then correct any word that needs correcting. In the sixth grade level only the pupils were asked to proofread for wrong words, wrong tense, wrong spelling, wrong endings, and wrong suffixes; but proofreading for just spelling errors was not emphasized.			
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?				
suggest that a teacher tell students proofreading is an important part of spelling?				
suggest that a series of lessons on proofreading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, beginning sounds. Entry and guide words in grade 3.	Beginning sounds, use of entry words and guide words and the use of a pronunciation key.		
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	Yes, one is included in each text.			
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proofreading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

TABLE VII

37

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED
IN SPELLING BY GINN AND COMPANY, 1967

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grade 4	Grades 5, 6, 7, & 8
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No, but includes one or two lessons on each level of finding mistakes in a sentence or paragraph.		
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, beginning sounds and alphabetizing.		Yes, same as grades one and two and the use of entry words, guide words, and pronunciation keys.	
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	Yes, a dictionary is included in each speller and it also recommends using <u>Thorndike-Barnhart</u> .			
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	Yes, the manual suggests to list on a large chart, the corresponding phonetic markings for the Thorndike-Barnhart markings or any other dictionary used.			
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes

TABLE VIII

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
SPELLING AND WRITING PATTERNS BY AILEEN BROTHERS, 1969

DOES THE TEXT	Level A	Level B	Level C	Levels D, E, and F
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	Yes
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	No	No	No	Yes
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	Yes, finding mistakes nine times.
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, ABC order.	ABC order, and use in using the dictionary key.	ABC order and a great deal of using the dictionary keys developed to familiarize pupils with dictionary symbols for sounds in words.	
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	No, but does include a word list.	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	No	No	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	Yes, the texts consider an elementary dictionary as one of the prime learning tools in spelling.			

TABLE IX

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
THE READING ROAD TO SPELLING BY HARPER & ROW, PUBLISHERS, 1965

DOES THE TEXT	Grade 1	Grade 2	Grade 3	Grades 4, 5, and 6
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	No	Yes, the texts suggest that the teacher should have the pupils proofread their work at the close of each lesson.		
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that a series of lessons on proofreading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Yes, initial consonant and speech sounds.		Yes, ABC order.	Yes, how to use guide words, etc.
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	No	No	Yes, a dictionary is included in all of the spellers.	
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	Yes	No	No	No
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	No	No	No	No

TABLE X

THE DICTIONARY AND PROOFREADING SKILLS THAT ARE PRESENTED IN
WORDS AND PATTERNS BY SCIENCE RESEARCH ASSOCIATES, INC., 1970

DOES THE TEXT	Level A	Level B	Level C	Level D&E
emphasize that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should proofread?	No	No	No	No
suggest a teacher tell students that proof-reading is an important part of spelling?	No	No	No	No
suggest that a series of lessons on proof-reading be used and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?	No	No	No	No
include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, what methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell are there?	Teaches ABC order, but does not suggest it as a dictionary skill.		Presents a dictionary page and shows how to use it.	Reviews what was learned in levels A, B, and C.
suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proof-reading skills?	No	No	No	No
suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?	No	No	Yes, a chart on how to use the dictionary is in each speller.	
suggest rewarding for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for proofreading?	No	No	No	No
suggest any games for dictionary skills?	No	Yes	Yes	No
emphasize the dictionary as a useful aid to spelling?	No	No	No	No

II. RESULTS OF THE QUESTIONNAIRE

A questionnaire was given to twenty-five of the teachers in Marshalltown, Iowa who were teaching students on the second-grade level and to seventeen teachers in Marshalltown who were teaching students on the fifth-grade level to determine to what extent proofreading for spelling errors was being taught in the classrooms at that present time.

The questionnaire was designed following an investigation of the literature. The questionnaire was validated with the help of the Marshalltown Director of Elementary Education and a third grade teacher. A copy of the teacher's questionnaire is presented in Appendix B.

It was found that all forty-two teachers taught dictionary skills. However, only thirty-three of the teachers said they included methods of helping students find a word in the dictionary which the students did not know how to spell. Forty-one out of the forty-two teachers made sure that his students had a dictionary readily available at school. Twenty-eight of the teachers said they used dictionary games, and nineteen teachers said they used dictionary bulletin boards in the teaching of dictionary skills. Only three teachers had a chart visible at all times on how to look up a word which their students did not know how to spell.

Thirty-three of the teachers said they mentioned proofreading to their students, thirty-two teachers said they suggested proofreading for spelling errors to their students, and twenty-four teachers said they suggested proofreading for spelling errors to their students and gave them suggestions on how to do so. Twenty-one teachers said they emphasized proofreading for spelling as being an important part of spelling.

Thirty-five of the teachers said they allowed time at the conclusion of most writing situations to perform the task of proofreading for spelling errors, twenty-five teachers let their students check any of their written work for spelling errors during their spelling period. Fourteen teachers reviewed proofreading for spelling errors with their students a few times a year, seven teachers taught students how to proofread in a series of lessons and five teachers taught students how to proofread for spelling errors in sequential steps. Five teachers said they used proofreading games and one teacher said he used proofreading bulletin boards for the teaching of proofreading for spelling errors. Ten teachers said they rewarded their students for proofreading and one teacher said he had a chart visible at all times in his room to help the student proofread for spelling errors.

In general, the teachers emphasized in their teaching of proofreading for spelling errors the things that were

emphasized in the spelling texts which included, most of all, the teaching of dictionary skills and, in some cases, the suggestion that the students would benefit from proofreading their written material to check for spelling errors. None of the texts suggested teaching proofreading for spelling errors in sequential steps and only five of the teachers said they taught proofreading in sequential steps. Eight of the teachers said they had been exposed to techniques for the teaching of proofreading of errors which might account for more teachers than texts having such programs.

On this and the following pages are the sixteen questions that were on the teacher questionnaire and a tabulation of the teacher's answers.

	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>
1. a. Do you teach dictionary skills?	42	0
b. If so, are any of them methods of helping students find a word they do not know how to spell?	33	9
2. Do you see that each of your students readily has available a dictionary to use at school?	41	1
3. Check one or more of the following. Do you:		
a. ever mention proofreading for spelling errors to your students?	33	9
b. suggest that students proofread their work for spelling errors?	32	10
c. suggest that students proofread their work for spelling errors and give some suggestions on how to do so?	24	18
d. emphasize proofreading for spelling errors to your students as being an important part of spelling?	21	21

	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>
4. Do you allow time at the conclusion of most writing situations to perform the task of proofreading for spelling errors? (Two teachers said they give no set time because proofreading is part of their assignments.) How much time? (Circle one) 0 minutes 1-10 minutes 11-20 minutes (1) (31) (2) (One teacher said the time varied.)	35	5
5. Do you let your students check any or all of their written work for spelling errors during their spelling period? (Four teachers said occasionally and one said she had no set spelling period.)	25	12
6. Do you suggest that students proofread their written work for spelling errors with a partner? (Six teachers said occasionally.)	10	26
7. Do you suggest that students proofread their written work for spelling errors by reading the material orally? (Three teachers said occasionally.)	9	30
8. If you specifically teach proofreading, do you: a. teach a series of lessons on proofreading for spelling errors? b. teach students how to proofread for spelling errors in sequential steps? . c. review proofreading for spelling errors with your students a few times a year?	7 5 14	35 37 28
9. Underline the following activities you have used and state approximately how many times you have used them in the last year. Activity: a. Dictionary games: Five teachers said 1-2 a week, eleven teachers said 3-6 times a year, six teachers said 10-30 times a year, four teachers said consistently, and two teachers said as needed. b. Dictionary bulletin boards: Fourteen teachers said 1-6 times a year, four teachers said consistently, and one teacher said as needed.		

- c. Reward students for using the dictionary: Six teachers said 1-5 times a year, thirteen teachers said daily as needed, and one teacher said whenever a student uses a dictionary on his own.
- d. Proofreading games: Two teachers said 2-4 times a month, two teachers said often, and one teacher said 2 times a year.
- e. Proofreading bulletin boards: One teacher said 10 times a year and three teachers said often.
- f. Reward students for proofreading: One teacher said 5 times a year and nine teachers said frequently.
- g. Others: One teacher said she proofreads her own blackboard work with her students daily.

	<u>YES</u>	<u>NO</u>
10. Do you have a chart on how to use the dictionary to find the spelling of a word visible at all times in your room?	3	39
11. Do you have a chart on how to proofread for spelling errors visible at all times in your room?	1	41
12. Second grade teachers: Do you use <u>Learn to Listen, Speak and Write</u> as your spelling guide? (Four teachers said yes but with supplementary material also.) If not, what do you use? Two teachers said their programmed readers have built-in spelling programs, one teacher said she teaches spelling according to the daily needs of her students, one teacher said she makes up her own program using many texts, and four teachers said they use Scott Foresman's <u>Spelling Our Language</u> .	13	8
13. Fifth grade teachers: Do you use <u>Spelling and Writing Patterns</u> as your spelling guide? If not, what do you use? One teacher uses the McCormick-Mather's series, one teacher the Lyons and Carnahan series, and two teachers use the Botel series.	13	4
14. In your schooling, have you ever been exposed to techniques for teaching proofreading? .	8	34

15. How many years have you been teaching?

Years	Number of Teachers	Years	Number of Teachers
$\frac{1}{2}$	3	21	1
1	1	22	1
2	2	23	1
3	6	25	1
4	3	28	1
5	2	30	1
6	3	31	1
7	1	33	1
8	1	35	1
10	2	36	1
13	1	38	1
15	2	43	1
20	1	No answer	2

16. Please make any comments or additions that you feel will make this information more complete. The comments that were made are as follows:

- a. "I feel proofreading is difficult to teach at the primary level."
- b. "In second grade there are many words they do not know how to spell. They are just learning and many times they will sound words out because they are not always found in their pictionary. Therefore, I do not emphasize proofreading with second graders."
- c. "The children, in general, are usually in too much of a hurry to do their work correctly let alone proofread it. It is like pulling teeth to get them to look over their work for obvious corrections."
- d. "Despite all the work done in the lower and upper grades, the children still cannot spell or proofread. They seem to be in such a hurry to complete their work that they do not have the time to stop and think."
- e. "I think proofreading is important as this will help the students in later years."
- f. "I feel proofreading is very important, but I have never known quite how to go about teaching it. Your information would be helpful."
- g. "This is important and I know I do not use proofreading enough. I will be interested in the results."
- h. "There is a need for teaching some techniques for proofreading written work. Little seems made of pushing this area aside from the teacher's own initiative."

CHAPTER IV

SUMMARY, RESULTS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

I. SUMMARY

The purpose of this study was to review the spelling literature and ten spelling series to see what definite techniques for teaching proofreading could be found. It was also the purpose of this study to investigate whether or not forty-two teachers who were teaching second and fifth grade students in the Marshalltown, Iowa Public School System taught proofreading in their spelling programs and what, if any, techniques in proofreading they taught their students.

All of the quantitative data contained in the research was obtained from two questionnaires composed after the pertinent literature had been reviewed.

II. RESULTS

In reviewing the literature, it was found that language authorities have for more than fifty years recommended the teaching of proofreading as a means of improving a student's ability to spell. In spite of this, there is a lack of research to substantiate their recommendations. These same spelling authorities failed, on the most part, to include a systematic program for the teaching of proofreading

for spelling errors. Most often, these same authorities suggested the use of adult-like motivators to encourage students to proofread their written material. In reviewing the literature it was also found that very little material had been written in the area of proofreading for spelling errors during the last three years.

In reviewing ten spelling series, published in the last five years, to determine to what extent specific techniques for teaching proofreading were discussed, it was found that three of the series did not mention proofreading at all. Where proofreading lessons were included, they were the correcting of mistakes found in lists or written material. Not one text suggested methods of teaching students to proofread for spelling errors although some said that proofreading was an important part of spelling. None of the texts suggested the teacher reward the students for proofreading. All of the series taught dictionary skills which included skills for helping students look up words they do not know how to spell.

Like language authorities and authors of spelling texts, many of the second and fifth grade teachers in Marshalltown, Iowa indicated on the teacher questionnaire that proofreading for spelling errors is important. However, in most cases, just like the language authorities and authors, very few of the teachers indicated that they taught

proofreading for spelling errors in sequential steps. As was true in the spelling texts, all the teachers spent considerable time teaching dictionary skills; however, very few of the texts or the teachers had visible, for daily viewing, a chart on how to look up a word that a student does not know how to spell or a chart on how to proofread for spelling errors. About a fourth of the teachers said they rewarded their students for proofreading. Eight of the teachers answering the questionnaire said they had been exposed to techniques for teaching proofreading in their schooling which might account for their rewarding students even though the authorities and texts did not emphasize this on an elementary level.

III. CONCLUSIONS

After reviewing the literature written by spelling authorities during the last fifty years, reviewing ten spelling series that have been written in the last five years, and talking with forty-two classroom teachers and reading their comments on their teacher questionnaires, it was clearly evident that most all agreed that an important aid in helping a student become independent in spelling correctly is learning how to proofread his written work effectively. This was true regardless of the chosen method or combination of methods used in the teaching of spelling.

This writer agrees with the authorities concerned with spelling that being able to correct one's own spelling will be the most often needed and used spelling skill both in and out of school and one of the most often used skill after one's school days are completed.

Though most language authorities recommended the teaching of proofreading for spelling errors as being desirable, there was a lack of research to substantiate their recommendations. And, although many authors of spelling texts suggested that proofreading should be encouraged, they failed to include a systematic program for the instruction of proofreading for spelling errors in their texts. Furthermore, although many teachers felt proofreading was an important part of spelling, few had initiated a systematic program of their own for the teaching of proofreading for spelling errors in written work.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

The magnitude of this field report imposed certain limitations which have been reviewed earlier in this investigation. However, certain conclusions have been reached in earlier research showing a positive relationship between the teaching of proofreading for spelling errors in a systematic program and accurate spelling. And, conclusions have been reached in this study showing that there is a

lack of methods and techniques for the systematic teaching of proofreading in the spelling program. Because of these conclusions, it would seem feasible that further research in this area should be done using:

1. Larger sample groups
2. A cross-section of socio-economic groups.
3. A longitudinal research method.
4. Follow-up studies to determine the amount of influence the teaching of proofreading will have on a student's work in the months to follow both in and out of school.

It would also seem appropriate for the authors of our spelling texts to incorporate in their texts some techniques for systematically teaching proofreading for spelling errors. Furthermore, it would seem worthwhile for the teachers of spelling to ask spelling authorities for more research and publishing companies for systematic approaches in the area of teaching proofreading. However, until the authorities and publishing companies have had time to do this, it would be most worthwhile for students and teachers if teachers would devise their own instructional programs for the systematic teaching of proofreading for spelling errors.

A suggested program for teaching proofreading systematically, from the evidence gathered during this study,

is that a systematic method of teaching proofreading include frequent use of the following:

1. Teaching alphabetizing.
2. Teaching alternative spelling forms.
3. Proofreading games.
4. Proofreading bulletin boards.
5. Rewarding for proofreading.
6. Dictionary games.
7. Dictionary bulletin boards.
8. Rewarding for using the dictionary.
9. Continual emphasis on proofreading.
10. Allowing time for proofreading.
11. Allowing students to proofread by reading their material orally.
12. Teaching students to proofread in sequential steps.
13. Proofreading with a partner.
14. Having a chart on how to proofread visible at all times.
15. Having visible at all times a chart on how to find a word the student does not know how to spell.
16. Teaching check-guessing. (Placing a check mark by words which the student is unsure of the spelling. Then, upon finishing the written work, the student corrects the spelling with the help of some of the above mentioned aids.)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A. BOOKS

- Bennett, D. M. New Methods and Materials in Spelling. Blackburn: The Dominion Press, 1967.
- Dawson, Mildred A. Children Learn the Language Arts. Minneapolis: Burgess Publishing Company, 1966.
- Dolch, Edward W. Better Spelling. Champaign, Illinois: Garrard Press, 1942.
- Greene, Harry A. and Walter T. Petty. Developing Language Skills in the Elementary School. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, Inc., 1959.
- Harding, Lowry W. (ed.). Guiding Children's Language Learning. Dubuque, Iowa: Wm. C. Brown Company Publishers, 1967.
- Herrick, Virgil E. and Leland B. Jacobs (eds.). Children and the Language Arts. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1955.
- Hildreth, Gertrude. Teaching Spelling--A Guide to Basic Principles and Practices. New York: Henry Holt and Company, 1955.
- Horn, Thomas D. and Henry J. Otto (eds.). Spelling Instruction: A Curriculum Wide Approach. Austin, Texas: University of Texas, 1954.
- McKee, Paul. Language in the Elementary School. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1939.
- Pryor, H. C. and M. S. Pittman. Guide to Teaching Spelling. New York: Macmillan Company, 1921.
- Shane, Harold G., Mary E. Redding, and Margaret C. Gillespie. Beginning Language Arts Instruction With Children. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Books, Inc., 1961.
- Tidyman, W. F. The Teaching of Spelling. Younkers, New York: World Book Company, 1919.

B. PERIODICALS

- DeBoer, J. J. "Composition, Handwriting and Spelling," Review of Educational Research, XXXI (April, 1961), 161-172.
- Frasch, Dorothy K. "How Well Do Sixth-graders Proofread for Spelling Errors?" Elementary School Journal, LXV (April, 1965), 381-385.
- Hildreth, Gertrude. "Word Frequency as a Factor in Learning to Read and Spell," Journal of Educational Research, XLI (February, 1948), 467-471.
- Horn, Thomas D. "How Syllables Can Help in Spelling," Education, LXXVI (January, 1965), 291-295.
- Horn, Thomas D. "Research in Spelling," Elementary English, XXXVII (March, 1960), 175-176.
- McFarland, W. H. "Relation Between Spelling Judgment and Spelling Vocabulary," Midland Schools (September, 1916), 19-21.
- McKowen, Clark. "Proofreading for Spelling Errors," English Journal, LII (October, 1963), 530.
- Personke, Carl and Albert H. Yee. "A Model for the Analysis of Spelling Behavior," Elementary English, XLIII (March, 1966), 278-284.
- Personke, Carl and Lester Knight. "Proofreading and Spelling: A Report and a Program," Elementary English, XLIV (November, 1967), 768-774.
- Sharpe, Maida Wood. "A Comparison of Three Approaches to Teaching Spelling," English Review, XXXVII (May, 1960), 317-320.
- Spache, George. "What's Wrong with our Teaching of Spelling?" Education, LXXVI (January, 1956), 296-299.
- Thomson, Eric W. and Charles G. Galloway. "Material Reinforcement and Success in Spelling," The Elementary School Journal, LXX (April, 1970), 395-398.
- Wittick, Mildred L. "Correctness and Freshness--Can Children's Writing Have Both?" Elementary School Journal, LX (March, 1960), 295-300.

C. SPELLING SERIES REVIEWED

- Basic Goals in Spelling. William Kottmeyer and Audrey Claus. McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1968. Grades 2-8.
- Harper/Row Basic Speller. Mabel O'Donnell, Willming Townes, and Carl F. Brown. Harper and Row, Publishers, 1965. Grades 2-6.
- Learn to Listen, Speak and Write. Marion Monroe, Ralph G. Nichols, W. Cabell Greet and William S. Gray. Scott, Foresman and Company, 1960, 1961 and 1964. Grades 1-3.
- My Word Book. Don C. Rogers, Lorrene Love Ort and Mary C. Serra. Lyons and Carnahan, 1966. Grades 1-8.
- Power to Spell. Paul S. Hanna, Jean S. Hanna, Richard E. Hodges, and E. Hugh Rudorf. Houghton Mifflin Co., 1967. Grades 2-6.
- Sound and Sense in Spelling. Richard Madden, Thorsten Carlson, and Betty Yarborough. Harcourt, Brace and World, 1967. Grades 2-8.
- Spell Correctly. Herman F. Benthul and Edna A. Anderson. Silver Burdett Company, 1968. Grades 2-8.
- Spelling. Edna M. Horrocks, Edith M. Evans, and Ralph C. Staiger. Ginn and Company, 1967. Grades 2-7.
- Spelling and Writing Patterns. Morton Botel, Cora Holsclaw, Gloria Cammarota, and Aileen Brothers. Follett Educational Corporation, 1968. Grades Primary-Secondary.
- The Reading Road to Spelling. Mabel O'Donnell, Willmina Townes, and Carl F. Brown. Harper and Row, Publishers, 1967. Grades 1-6.
- Words and Patterns. Katharine M. Day and Patricia C. Lightbody. S.R.A., 1970. Grades A-E.

D. UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS

- Goss, James E. "Analysis of Accuracy of Spelling in Written Compositions of Elementary School Children and the Effects of Proofreading Emphasis upon Accuracy," Dissertation Abstracts, University Microfilm, Inc. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Cushing-Malloy, Inc., 1959.

Knight, Lester B. "The Effectiveness of a Program of Proofreading Instruction on Spelling in Written Composition." Unpublished Master's thesis, The University of Texas, 1965.

Oswalt, William W. "The Effects of Proofreading for Spelling Errors on Spelling Achievement of Fifth Grade Pupils." Unpublished Doctoral dissertation, Temple University, 1962.

Tireman, Lloyd Spencer. "Ability of Grade Pupils to Proofread their Written Work." Unpublished Master's thesis, The University of Iowa, 1924.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

QUESTIONNAIRE USED TO REVIEW TEXTS

1. Does the text emphasize that proofreading is an important part of spelling?
2. Does the text suggest that the teacher should emphasize that the student should perform the task of proofreading?
3. Does the text suggest a teacher tell students that proofreading for mistakes is an important part of spelling?
4. Does the text suggest that a series of lessons on proofreading be used and if so, what are they?
5. Does the text suggest teaching students to proofread in sequential steps and if so, what are they?
6. Does the text include the teaching of dictionary skills and if so, are any methods of helping students find words they do not know how to spell?
7. Does the text suggest that each student have a personal desk copy of a dictionary to use at school?
8. Does the text suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on proofreading skills?
9. Does the text suggest that the teacher use charts or displays on dictionary skills?
10. Does the text suggest that the teacher reward students for proofreading?
11. Does the text suggest any games for proofreading skills?
12. Does the text suggest any games for dictionary skills?
13. Does the text emphasize the dictionary as being a useful aid to spelling?

APPENDIX B

TEACHER QUESTIONNAIRE

In order to complete my requirements for a master's degree from Drake University, I am doing a study on the effects of proofreading in teaching spelling. As a part of this study, I am seeking your assistance in completion of the following questionnaire and have permission from the superintendent's office to do so.

Will you please answer each question as it applies to your classroom situation. Except for those questions that specify otherwise, please answer yes or no. You need not sign your name.

Thank you for your help.

Kay Augustine

1. a. Do you teach dictionary skills? _____
b. If so, are any of them methods of helping students find a word they do not know how to spell? _____
2. Do you see that each of your students readily has available a dictionary to use at school? _____
3. Check one or more of the following. Do you:
_____ a. ever mention proofreading for spelling errors to your students?
_____ b. suggest that students proofread their work for spelling errors?
_____ c. suggest that students proofread their work for spelling errors and give some suggestions on how to do so?
_____ d. emphasize proofreading for spelling errors to your students as being an important part of spelling?

4. Do you allow time at the conclusion of most writing situations to perform the task of proofreading for spelling errors? _____ How much time? (Circle one)
a. 0 minutes b. 1-10 minutes c. 11-20 minutes
5. Do you let your students check any or all of their written work for spelling errors during their spelling period? _____
6. Do you suggest that students proofread their written work for spelling errors with a partner? _____
7. Do you suggest that students proofread their written work for spelling errors by reading the material orally? _____
8. If you specifically teach proofreading, do you:
(Check one or more.)
_____ a. teach a series of lessons on proofreading for spelling errors?
_____ b. teach students how to proofread for spelling errors in sequential steps?
_____ c. review proofreading for spelling errors with your students a few times a year?
9. Underline the following activities you have used and state approximately how many times you have used them in the last year.
- | <u>Activity</u> | <u>How many times used in the last year:</u> |
|---|--|
| a. Dictionary games | _____ |
| b. Dictionary bulletin boards | _____ |
| c. Reward students for using the dictionary | _____ |
| d. Proofreading games | _____ |
| e. Proofreading bulletin boards | _____ |
| f. Reward students for proofreading | _____ |
| g. Others _____ | _____ |
10. Do you have a chart on how to use the dictionary to find the spelling of a word visible at all times in your room? _____
11. Do you have a chart on how to proofread for spelling errors visible at all times in your room? _____
12. Second grade teachers: Do you use Learn to Listen, Speak and Write as your spelling guide? _____ If not, what do you use? _____

13. Fifth grade teachers: Do you use Spelling and Writing Patterns as your spelling guide? _____ If not, what do you use? _____
14. In your schooling, have you ever been exposed to techniques for teaching proofreading? _____
15. How many years have you been teaching? _____
16. Please make any comments or additions that you feel will make this information more complete.

Thank you again,

Kay H. H. H.